

**EMERYVILLE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
ACTION RECAP
April 27, 2017**

I. CONVENE AND ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by Chair Steven Keller. Commissioners present: Philip Banta, Linda Barrera, Gail Donaldson, Christine Scott Thomson, Vice Chair Lawrence Cardoza and Chair Steven Keller. Commissioner Sam Kang had an excused absence.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT – NONE

III. ACTION RECAPS – February 23, March 9 and March 23, 2017

Motions were made to approve the Action Recaps.

February 23, 2017:

Moved: Donaldson
Seconded: Cardoza
Vote: Ayes: Banta, Donaldson, Cardoza, Keller
Abstained: Barrera, Thomson
Excused: Kang

March 9, 2017:

Moved: Donaldson
Seconded: Keller
Vote: Ayes: Banta, Barrera, Donaldson, Cardoza, Keller
Abstained: Thomson
Excused: Kang

March 23, 2017:

Moved: Cardoza
Seconded: Thomson
Vote: Ayes: Barrera, Donaldson, Thomson, Cardoza, Keller
Abstained: Banta
Excused: Kang

IV. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director Bryant reported on recent City Council actions and reminded the Commission that the joint meeting with the City Council to consider ways that the City can assist small businesses will be on Tuesday, May 16 from 1 to 3 pm in the community room at ECCL, preceded by a networking lunch from 12 to 1.

V. DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST AND EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Keller said he would be recused from the Public Market Directional Master Sign Program due to the proximity of his residence. Commissioner Donaldson said she would be recused from the Sherwin Williams items because she works for a firm that does business with Lennar.

VI. STUDY SESSIONS

- A. **Sherwin Williams – Architectural Final Development Plan (FDP17-001)** – A second study session to solicit comments on the Final Development Plan (FDP) design concept for buildings in the Sherwin Williams Planned Unit Development site. The Preliminary Development Plan (PDP) for the project was approved by the City Council on November 1, 2016. CEQA Status: An Environmental Impact Report was prepared for the project and certified by the Emeryville City Council on September 6, 2016. General Plan Land Use Classification: Mixed Use with Residential and Park/Open Space; Zoning District: Planned Unit Development (PUD-7) with Park Avenue District Overlay (P-A). (Applicant: LMC Emeryville I Investor LLC) (Owners: SWACE, LLC, c/o The Sherwin-Williams Company and City of Emeryville as Successor Agency to the Emeryville Redevelopment Agency) (APNs: 49-1041-26-15 and -16)

Commissioner Donaldson was recused and left the room.

Miroo Desai, Senior Planner, presented and answered Commissioners' questions. Staff requested that the Commission give direction regarding the following issues:

- (1) Does the Commission believe that the proposed design, building materials and aesthetics are successful in providing adequate attention to the historic and industrial roots of the community? Does the Commission have specific comments regarding design, colors and materials of the four buildings?
- (2) Does the Commission agree that the proposed brick colored cement plaster adjacent to brick veneer on Building B-1 be replaced with brick veneer?
- (3) Does the Commission agree with the staff recommendation that the project implement elements of the Public Art Master Plan identified above?
- (4) Does the Commission support the incorporation of sustainable, green features such as green roofs and/or solar panels into the project?

Applicant Kevin Ma of Lennar, Ron Metzger of LPAS Architecture & Design, and Bill Shultz of ima design, landscape architects, presented and answered the Commissioner's questions

The meeting was opened for public comment.

Jack Ghizzoni, resident of 1500 Park resident and member of PARC, thanked Lennar for their cooperation with the community. He encouraged retail space and community amenities on the ground floor and not privatizing the public facing parts of the building.

Mike McConnell, 1500 Park resident and member of PARC, echoed Mr. Ghizzoni's comments by saying that because of its private use of space, Parc on Powell not welcoming and suggested that the pass-through include a coffee shop for use by the community as well as the residents.

Kristin Peterson, resident of the 45th Street Artist's Cooperative, had high marks for Lennar in creating a sense of community and expressed hopes for open space with public facing parts of the building to be used by the community.

Public comment was closed.

Commissioners expressed their appreciation for the applicant's continued open communication with the community and willingness to change in order to integrate the design comfortably into the neighborhood. The Commissioners also echoed the comments

regarding the community's use of building amenities, including the roof-top pool and a "resident's café".

Commissioners expressed a desire for continuity among design styles with brick being used as a unifying material. One Commissioner suggested flipping the orientation of Building C to allow more sunlight in the podium courtyard in the afternoon.

Commissioners suggested including more activity on street including retail, co-working space such as "Wework", and a walking circuit of sculptures that would engage the public along with plaques about the history of the area starting and ending at the Art Gallery.

A Commissioner encouraged the use of green/solar and integrative features such that did not drive up costs and asked whether the building was a candidate for building certification for its green features.

The over-arching sentiment expressed was a desire for openness and creativity with one Commissioner suggesting that the Applicant let the architect "go crazy".

Ms. Desai referred the Commission to a letter from the Park Avenue Resident's Committee (PARC) in which they stated that they would advocate for a condition of approval that would allow ground-floor amenities to be open to the public for a fee. Assistant City Attorney Andrea Visveshwara advised the Commission that the applicant may voluntarily agree to such a condition, but that it should not be imposed unilaterally by the City.

- B. **Sherwin Williams – Public Park and Open Space Final Development Plan (FDP17-002)** – A second study session to solicit comments on the Final Development Plan (FDP) conceptual design programming of the public park and other public open spaces within the Sherwin Williams Planned Unit Development site. The Preliminary Development Plan (PDP) for the project was approved by the City Council on November 1, 2016. CEQA Status: An Environmental Impact Report was prepared for the project and certified by the Emeryville City Council on September 6, 2016. General Plan Land Use Classification: Mixed Use with Residential and Park/Open Space; Zoning District: Planned Unit Development (PUD-7) with Park Avenue District Overlay (P-A). (Applicant: LMC Emeryville I Investor LLC)(Owners: SWACE, LLC, c/o The Sherwin-Williams Company and City of Emeryville as Successor Agency to the Emeryville Redevelopment Agency) (APNs: 49-1041-26-15 and -16)

Commissioner Donaldson was recused and remained out the room.

Miroo Desai, Senior Planner, presented and answered Commissioners' questions. Staff requested that the Commission give direction regarding the following issues:

- (1) Does the Commission consent with the overall programming of the area and do you agree with specific programming within the four districts? Are there any additional suggestions for programming? Does the Commission wish to add or exclude any element?
- (2) Does the Commission have recommendations for materials in the plaza areas?
- (3) Does the Commission have any comments or preferences for the tree and plant palette? The Park Avenue District Plan calls out for *Ginkgo biloba* trees for all new street areas in the project area. The applicant proposes *Gleditsia triacanthos var. inermis* 'Shademaster' (Thornless Honeylocust) or *Ulmus parvifolia* 'True Green' (Chinese Elm) for Hubbard Street Extension and 46th Street and *Ginkgo biloba* trees for Sherwin Avenue. Is this proposal for street trees acceptable to the Commission?

Applicant Kevin Ma of Lennar, Ron Metzger of LPAS Architecture & Design, and Bill Shultz of ima design, landscape architects, presented and answered the Commissioner's questions.

Commissioners encouraged the inclusion of 8,000 square feet of retail rather than 2,000 square feet, the addition of an "Incredible Edibles" Community Garden, and ensuring that shadows will not impact planting. Commissioners encouraged the use of creative unconventional surfaces to integrate art, exercise equipment, games, recycled water, and plants that attract wildlife. One Commissioner expressed a desire for more details to understand the restroom and bikeshare amenities.

The meeting was opened for public comment.

Richard Heng, homeowner at Blue Star Corner, said the plans look great so far. He said he is a huge basketball fan and would appreciate that the courts remain. Public access to the views would be appreciated.

Commissioners expressed varying opinions as to whether the orientation of the trees should be curvilinear or straight lines. A Commissioner recommended the use of a "remarkable" visual terminus and a natural theatrical/musical stage area.

VII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. 6701 Shellmound Residential Project ("Nady Site") Extension Request (UPDR14-003)** – Consideration of a request for a two-year extension of a Conditional Use Permit and Design Review for a 186-unit residential development on a 2.27-acre site located at 6701 Shellmound Street that was approved by the Planning Commission on March 24, 2016. The project includes a Tree Removal Permit for removal of two street trees. CEQA Status: Environmental Impact Report certified by Planning Commission on March 24, 2016. General Plan Land Use Classification: Mixed Use with Residential; Zoning District: Mixed Use with Residential (MUR). (Applicant/Owner: Nady Trust U/D/T)(APN:49-1490-2)

This item was continued to a future meeting.

A break was taken from 9.08 p.m. to 9.17 p.m.

VIII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- B. Public Market Directional Sign Program (SIGN16-028)** – Consideration of a Major Sign Permit for directional signage throughout the Public Market site, specifically along Shellmound Street and 63rd Street. CEQA Status: This project is exempt from environmental review under State CEQA Guidelines Section 15311(a) which applies to placement of on-premises signs; and the "general rule" at Section 15061(b)(3) because it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the proposal may have a significant effect on the environment. General Plan Land Use Classification: Mixed Use with Residential, Park/Open Space, and Major Transit Hub; Zoning District: Planned Unit Development (PUD-2) (Applicant/Owner: AG-CCRP Public Market L.P.) (APNs:49-1556-1; -2; and -3)

Commissioner Keller was recused; Vice Chair Cardoza presided over this item.

Navarre Oaks, Assistant Planner, presented and answered Commissioners' questions.

Applicant Tim Bacon, City Center Realty Partners, presented and answered Commissioners' questions

The public hearing was opened; there was no one who wished to speak; the public hearing was closed.

The Commission expressed concern that one of the parking signs near the entrance to the garage needed an arrow to be more clear; the Applicant agreed to this suggestion.

A motion was made to approve the application with the added condition of approval that an arrow be added to one sign near the entrance to the garage.

Moved: Banta
Seconded: Donaldson
Vote: Ayes: Banta, Barrera, Donaldson, Thomson, Cardoza
Recused: Keller
Excused: Kang

IX. COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS

Chair Keller said that he attended the grand opening of the Paradita Eatery at the Public Market, and it was a very nice event.

X. ADJOURNMENT – The meeting was adjourned at 9:49 p.m.

THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING WILL BE HELD ON THURSDAY, MAY 25, 2017 AT 6:30 P.M. IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, 1333 PARK AVENUE, EMERYVILLE, CA 94608