

**EMERYVILLE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
ACTION RECAP
REGULAR MEETING
JUNE 24, 2010**

I. CONVENE, ROLL CALL, AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. by Chair Arthur Hoff. Commissioners present: Lawrence Cardoza, Art Hoff, Gail Donaldson, John Scheuerman, Frank Flores, Patricia Jeffery and Jim Martin.

Chair Hoff noted that this was Commissioner Martin and Jeffery's last meeting, and that Resolutions of Appreciation for each had been prepared. He asked Director Bryant to read the resolutions. Chair Hoff then presented framed copies of the resolutions, signed by all of the Commissioners, to Commissioners Martin and Jeffery.

Director Bryant noted that Vanessa Kuemmerle and Steven Steinberg had been appointed by the City Council to replace Commissioners Martin and Jeffery, and that both had been invited to attend tonight's meeting. Ms. Kuemmerle was out of town and unable to attend. Mr. Steinberg introduced himself to the Commission.

The Commission also congratulated Commissioner Scheuerman on his reappointment.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

Resident Brian Donahue commented on the need for family-friendly housing in Emeryville. He described a School Board presentation in which the elements of family-friendly housing were described. He felt that the information should be studied by the Planning Commission so as to better encourage family-friendly housing. Staff was directed to obtain the materials distributed at the School Board meeting.

III. ACTION RECAP – April 22, 2009

After corrections by Commissioner Jeffery, Commissioner Flores moved approval of the Action Recap and the motion was seconded by Commissioner Cardoza. Commissioner Martin abstained. The Action Recap was approved without exception.

IV. DIRECTORS REPORT

Director Bryant reported on recent City Council/Redevelopment Agency actions, noting that there had been four regular Council/Agency meetings and three special budget meetings since the last Planning Commission meeting in April.

On May 4, the Council passed a resolution of intent to vacate Magnolia Street north of 36th Street, so that the vacated area can be converted to a landscaped public pedestrian plaza as part of the proposed Ambassador Housing project; on June 1, the Council passed a resolution vacating the street. Also on May 4, the City's Environmental Analyst gave a status report on implementation of the General Plan Sustainability Element and Climate Action Plan, and the Council considered a proposal for bike lanes on Hollis Street south of 40th.

On May 18, the Council held a study session on the Parks and Recreation Strategic Plan. They also approved the first reading of a Zoning Ordinance amendment on the sale of firearms and ammunition; the ordinance was passed on June 1. The Council passed a resolution initiating an amendment to the Interim Zoning Regulations in response to a lawsuit filed by the owners of property in the two blocks bounded by 62nd, Hollis, 64th, and Doyle Streets that are designated Park/Open Space in the General Plan. The Council approved a farmers market on Haven Street

adjacent to the Civic Center every Thursday through December. The Council considered and rejected a proposal to reduce the number of Planning Commissioners from seven to five, with each Council member appointing one Planning Commissioner. The Council reconfirmed its previous decision to direct staff to paint "Bicycle Boulevard" stencils on Horton Street between 40th Street and Sherwin Avenue, without bike lanes, pending completion of the new Pedestrian-Bicycle Plan. Finally, The Council issued a proclamation recognizing Wendy Sylvani for her years of service as the Executive Director of the Emeryville Transportation Management Association (TMA); later in the meeting, Peter Oswald, the new Executive Director of the TMA, introduced himself to the Council.

The Council held special budget hearings on May 10, 11, and 13. The Planning and Building Department's budget presentation was on May 10. Accomplishments for the last two fiscal years, and goals for the next two years, were reviewed. The Department's proposed reductions included charging more staff time to the General Plan Maintenance Fund, eliminating one Planning Intern position, and reducing professional services for plan check and building inspections. The Council agreed with the reductions but directed that the intern position be reinstated, to be funded out of the General Plan Maintenance Fund instead of the General Fund. The Council approved the budget on June 1.

On June 1, the Council approved RFPs for a General Contractor and for a Construction Manager for construction of the South Bayfront Pedestrian/Bicycle Bridge. The Council also approved a noise waiver for evening and weekend work in August at the CMF building on Horton Street on the Novartis campus.

On June 15, the Council approved a contract with WC3 for the next two fiscal years to continue to provide Building Division consulting services, including plan check, building inspection, and office support. The Council also approved an extension of Pixar's existing noise waiver for Saturday work through December for construction of the Phase II building. Finally, the Council reappointed Planning Commissioner John Scheuerman for another 3-year term, and appointed Vanessa Kuemmerle and Steven Steinberg to replace outgoing Commissioners Jim Martin and Patti Jeffery.

The Zoning Update Steering Committee continues to work on the new Zoning Ordinance. Their last meeting was last Tuesday, June 22 at which the design guidelines and parking regulations were reviewed. The committee approved the design guidelines with some revisions and directed that they be forwarded to the Commission and Council for adoption. The committee commented on the parking regulations, which are a work in progress, and approved a staff proposal where the minimum parking requirements for nonresidential uses would be set at 2/3 of the demand, with a maximum allowable of 10% over the demand, either of which could be exceeded with a use permit. The committee also heard an update on the schedule. The committee agreed to meet in August and then again in early December, with status reports every two months thereafter, with the intention of having a complete draft of the ordinance early in 2011. A full report on the status and schedule of the Zoning Ordinance update will be given to the City Council at their next meeting on July 20.

The new computerized permit tracking system, CRW's "TRAKiT", is now operational for a "beta testing" phase. The schedule calls for the system to "go live" in early September. After staff is comfortable with the system, the "e-TRAKiT" module will be implemented which will provide citizen access to the system via the City's website. The system will include all planning and building permits, as well as historical information on some previously issued permits.

Director Bryant noted that Deputy City Attorney Abby Bilkiss had gotten another job and was no longer with the City. Assistant City Attorney Michael Guina will once again be staffing the Planning Commission on behalf of the City Attorney's Office.

V. STUDY SESSION

- A. **64th & Christie Residential Building (FDP08-02)** – A Study Session to review a Final Development Plan for a 193-unit, 5-story residential building located at the southeast corner of 64th Street and Christie Avenue. This building is part of Phase I of the Marketplace Redevelopment Project Planned Unit Development (PUD) that was approved by the City Council on August 5, 2008. CEQA Status: Environmental Impact Report for Marketplace Redevelopment Project PUD certified by City Council on January 15, 2008. General Plan Designation: Mixed Use with Residential; Zoning Designation: Planned Unit Development (PUD) Mixed Use. (Applicant: TMG Partners) (Owner: Rockwood Christie LLC) (49-1492-6-1; 49-1492-8)

Commissioners Donaldson and Scheuerman recused themselves due to potential conflicts of interest.

Miroo Desai, Senior Planner, made the staff presentation.

Denise Pinkston of TGM Partners made a PowerPoint presentation.

Rob Zirkle, project architect, made a presentation

Jeffery Miller, the project landscape architect, made a presentation.

Public Comments

John Scheuerman, speaking as a citizen, said he generally approved of the project but had some concerns, including its connection to the neighborhood and nearby Christie Park, the effects of movie theater parking access on the park and project, the narrow sidewalks, and the need for balconies on the south side of the building.

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Martin had a number of design suggestions. He said that the sidewalks must be increased for a broader pedestrian experience, and that the interior plaza needs a lot of work—specifically, that turf and seating are needed. The elevator should go up to a rooftop area on the southwest of the building to create more outdoor space. The current design is not family housing, as it claims. The east elevation is massive and ugly; it needs articulation to break it up.

Commissioner Jeffery said that the entry needs to relate to the park. The sidewalks are inadequate and inconsistent with the General Plan and Design Guidelines. Loading and trash areas on 64th should be pleasant to look at, and easy to access. Truck parking needs to be provided. Commissioner Jeffery agreed with Commissioner Martin that the east façade needs work. She said the developer should call out the entry on 64th Street as they did the main entry on Christie. The podium interior plaza needs more seating. A garden and/or plots should be provided on the roof, as well as solar panels.

Commissioner Flores said that a taller building with more open space would be better. He said that the corner of Christie and 64th Streets needs some corner treatment, or perhaps a live-work unit. There needs to be roof articulations, perhaps a deck. The ground floor units along Christie need individual stoops, instead of a shared “porch”. The sidewalk needs work, public art should be incorporated, and there is too much stucco. The north side is nice. A model would be helpful. Operations need to be examined, especially trash.

Commissioner Cardoza said that the massing of the project makes it one big box; instead, the footprint could be the shape of an “X” – views need to face out, not in. A nicer façade is needed, and in general the project needs work.

Commissioner Hoff said that the sidewalk on 63rd is a problem. He said the plaza was okay, as there is a park so nearby. The connection between the plaza and public realm is bogus—the public can't see into the space. The cut through the building on 63rd should go all the way up.

- B. IKEA Off-Site Warehouse (UP10-03, DR10-12)** – A Study Session to review a Conditional Use Permit and Design Review application to establish a 55,400 square foot off-site warehouse at 5000 Hollis Street (Level(3) building) by IKEA to allow customers to pick up large item merchandise at this site. CEQA Status: This project is exempt from environmental review under State CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 which pertains to modifications to existing structures. General Plan Designation: Office/Technology; Zoning Designation: Office/Technology (O/T) (Applicant: IKEA Property, Inc)(Owner: BTE Equipment, LLC) (APN: 49-1041-11-4)

Miroo Desai, Senior Planner, presented the staff report.

Bud Greenhouse, IKEA representative, made a presentation, with help from Alice Tank, IKEA representative, Tony Batey, Broker, and Ryan McManus and Josen Reed of Level(3).

Public Comment

Rachel Legree, a resident of Emery Bay Village, said that the primary use of the project was retail, not storage, as the staff report claimed. The 140 trips IKEA projected for each Saturday will have a large impact on the neighborhood. Many people will think this project is the main IKEA store. The area is zoned for Office/Technology, not retail.

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Scheuerman said that he liked reducing the paved surface of the parking lot, but otherwise there were a number of problems, including excessive signage, too many flags, pick-up hours, the parking traffic flow, pedestrian obstacles. The effect conflicts with the green street vision for 53rd Street in the General Plan; there needs to be an emphasis on the landscape design. Also, the front of the building needs work.

Commissioner Cardoza agreed that the signs were too much, but felt that the parking was okay. He liked that the project used the existing (unused) space in the building, and thought it was a decent project.

Commissioner Donaldson said the signage was the opposite of where we want to be. She said a traffic study is necessary for the project, and that truck delivery is an issue, especially as the trucks would be idling next to a residential use. The design in general was inappropriate for a residential adjacent project. She agreed that the 53rd green street and bike boulevard uses would conflict with the project, and felt that customers loading their cars in the parking drive aisles would result in a messy, if not dangerous, situation.

Commissioner Flores said he thought the traffic and use were okay, but cited the green street/bike boulevard as a potential conflict. The customer loading needs to pull up to the building not be across the drive aisle from the building, and needs to be covered. He said the colors and branding should be toned down. This is a good use for an empty space. The plaza is nice as it is and should be kept.

Commissioner Jeffery said it was good to occupy the space, and the use is okay, but a traffic study is needed for access and circulation. The building should be signed as a warehouse, not a store; the flags should be removed. The plaza should be enhanced for customers and employees. The truck delivery hours should not be so early in the morning.

Commissioner Martin said the project needs another study session. The loading space in the parking lot needs to be open for police and fire access. Cars must back up to the loading area. The customer and delivery entries should be switched. IKEA needs to meet with the Emery Bay residents to address any outstanding issues. Traffic, circulation and landscaping details need to be worked out. This use doesn't belong on the east side of the railroad tracks.

Chair Hoff said IKEA needs to show that pick-up is feasible. The signage doesn't work; there shouldn't be any flags or billboards.

VI. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. **Fire Station #2 (UP10-02/DR10-07)** – A Conditional Use Permit and Design Review to rebuild the City of Emeryville's Fire Station #2, located at 6303 Hollis Street. The new building will be a total of 12,930 square feet. The first floor will include a public lobby, classroom, offices and a day room, as well as three apparatus bays. The second floor will consist of bunk rooms and a workout space. CEQA Status: This project is exempt from environmental review under State CEQA Guidelines Section 15333 In-Fill Development Projects and the "general rule" at Section 15061(b)(3) because it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the proposal may have a significant effect on the environment. General Plan Designation: Public with Neighborhood Retail Overlay; Zoning District: Public (PUB) with Neighborhood Retail Overlay (NR) and North-Hollis Overlay (N-H). (Applicant/Owner: City of Emeryville) (APN: 49-1487-2-2)

Arly Cassidy, Assistant Planner, presented the staff report.

Candice Wong, architect for the project, made a presentation.

Public Comment

The public hearing was opened. There was no one wishing to speak; the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Martin said a bulletin board should be on an outside wall. He was not fond of the public art, and felt that new art should go with the new project. He said the landscaping was limited, and should be expanded.

Commissioner Jeffery said she loved the overall building and look, but thought the current public art should be moved to the back.

Commissioner Flores said that the plaza should have more benches, agreed that a bulletin board was needed, and thought the landscaping should be kept low maintenance.

Commissioner Donaldson said the project looked good. For improved, low-maintenance landscaping, El Cerrito's new city hall should be referenced. The current choice of pear trees, which are slow growing and often diseased, should be reevaluated.

Commissioner Scheuerman was concerned with the noise from the workout room. Ms. Wong responded that the room would be acoustically insulated. Commissioner Scheuerman said it was a great project. He agreed that El Cerrito's city hall should be referenced for the landscaping, and with the bike parking recommendation in the staff report. He also said that the sidewalks should all be 7'6" wide.

Motion: To approve Fire Station #2 with the bike parking recommended in the staff report, and the recommendation that the art, landscaping, sidewalk width, bulletin board placement and benches be modified as suggested by Commissioners. Staff to work with the applicant to resolve these issues.

Moved: Hoff
Seconded: Cardoza

Substitute Motion: To approve Fire Station #2 with the bike parking recommended in the staff report, and the recommendations that the art, landscaping, sidewalk width, bulletin board placement and benches as suggested by Commissioners be required as conditions of approval.

Moved: Martin
Seconded: Scheuerman
Vote: Ayes: Donaldson, Jeffery, Martin, Scheuerman, Flores
Noes: Cardoza, Hoff

- B. Housing Element of the General Plan** – Consideration of revised Housing Element. Revisions include updated data and added information in response to the State Housing and Community Development Department (HCD) review comments. CEQA Status: Negative Declaration for Housing Element approved by City Council on June 16, 2009; Environmental Impact Report for General Plan certified by City Council on October 13, 2009.

Deborah Diamond, Project Manager, presented the staff report.

The public hearing was opened. There was no one wishing to speak; the public hearing was closed.

Motion: To approve the Housing Element of the General Plan and forward it to the City Council with a recommendation for adoption.

Moved: Flores
Seconded: Cardoza
Vote: Ayes: Cardoza, Donaldson, Jeffery, Martin, Scheuerman, Flores, Hoff

VII. COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS – None

VIII. ADJOURNMENT – The meeting was adjourned at 10:42 p.m.

THE NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING WILL BE HELD ON THURSDAY, July 22, 2010 AT 6:30 P.M. IN THE CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, 1333 PARK AVENUE, EMERYVILLE, CA 94608